## TAXI



TAXICAB RATES \& CHARGES
IN SOUTHERN NEVADA

A Review \& Analysis

## Overview

- Introduction
- Historical \& Current Rates
- General Price Inflation \& Rates
- Operating Cost Inflation \& Rates
- The Fuel Surcharge
- Additional Charges
- Competitive Landscape



## INTRODUCTION

## Introduction

- Applied Analysis was retained by the Livery Operators Association ("LOA") to provide a general history relative to the rates and charges currently imposed on taxicab rides in Clark County.
- This analysis relies on a series of studies and reports previously completed, including an October 2014 report comparing operating costs to rates as well as a 2016 report responding to an audit issued by the State of Nevada.




## HISTORICAL \& CURRENT RATES

## Nevada Taxicab Authority Rate History

| Date | Drop <br> Fee | Per Mile Fee <br> (Inc. Fuel Surcharge) | Per Mile Fee <br> (Exc. Fuel Surcharge) | Notes |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $11 / 13 / 2008$ | $\$ 3.30$ | --- | $\$ 2.40$ |  |
| $4 / 26 / 2011$ | $\$ 3.30$ | $\$ 2.60(\$ 0.20$ Fuel Surcharge) | $\$ 2.40$ | McCarran Airport fee |
| $7 / 1 / 2013$ | $\$ 3.30$ | $\$ 2.60(\$ 0.20$ Fuel Surcharge) | $\$ 2.40$ | raised \$0.20 to \$2.00 |
| $10 / 20 / 2014$ | $\$ 3.45$ | $\$ 2.88(\$ 0.20$ Fuel Surcharge) | $\$ 2.68$ | Wait time fee raised <br> $\$ 2.40$ to $\$ 32.40 / h r$. |
| $12 / 17 / 2014$ | $\$ 3.45$ | --- | $\$ 2.68$ | 3\% excise tax added <br> to all fares \& fees |
| $8 / 24 / 2015$ | $\$ 3.50$ | $\$ 2.88(\$ 0.12$ Fuel Surcharge) | $\$ 2.76$ |  |
| $11 / 16 / 2015$ | $\$ 3.50$ | --- | $\$ 2.76$ |  |

Source: Nevada Taxicab Authority. Note: Data are reported for November 13, 2008 going forward.

## Nevada Taxicab Authority Rate History

(1971-2016); All Prices Include Fuel Surcharges


Source: Nevada taxicab rate history compiled by Livery Operators Association; calculations by AA; prices exclude wait times; prices are as of October each year.


## GENERAL PRICE INFLATION \& RATES

## QUESTION

## Have taxicab rates and charges kept pace with the rate of inflation?






Source: CPI data is from the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (west urban area); calculations by Applied Analysis.

Concern
CPI includes fuel cost; the analysis of taxi rates did not include the fuel surcharge in effect between April 2011 and December 2014 when sustained gas prices were above \$3.25 per gallon.

Alternative Analysis \#1: Replace CPI with Core CPI, which excludes the cost of fuel and energy, creating an analysis that excludes fuel from both sides of the equation.

Cumulative Comparison of Actual and InflationAdjusted Per-Mile Charges
 Calculations utilize actual number of trips by month, CPI and assumes 5 miles per trip on average.

## Concern

CPI includes fuel cost; the analysis of taxi rates did not include the fuel surcharge in effect between April 2011 and December 2014 when sustained gas prices were above $\$ 3.25$ per gallon.

Alternative Analysis \#2: Replace CPI with Transportation Services CPI, which more accurately captures the impact of higher fuel prices; fuel surcharge included.

Cumulative Comparison of Actual and InflationAdjusted Per-Mile Charges


Source: CPI data is from the U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics (west urban area); calculations by Applied Analysis Calculations utilize actual number of trips by month, CPI and assumes 5 miles per trip on average.

## Taxicab Rates are Not Excessive on their Face

- Since 2008, rate changes have generally lagged inflation. Currently, rates are essentially aligned with inflation.
- Other factors including increases in higher wages and increased fees and taxes are factors that may also need to be considered.
- Alternative analyses have shown that changes to the type of Consumer Price Index used still result in charges that are lower than inflation-adjusted numbers.



## OPERATING COST INFLATION \& RATES

## QUESTION

## Have taxicab rates and charges kept pace with operating costs?

While prices have increased over time, taxicab rates have generally remained below the level of inflation.

Nevada Taxicab Authority 43-Year Rate History Compound Annual Growth Rate (CAGR)

■ CAGR, Price of a Three Mile Ride (Non-McCarran origination) - CAGR, Price of a Six Mile Ride (McCarran origination)

■ CAGR, Inflation of U.S. Dollar
$4.2 \% 4.3 \% 4.2 \%$


1982-2014


1992-2014

 Lvery operaros asocanton LAS VEGAS TAXICAB RATE ANALYSIS occober 2014 - ar

Operators' major expenses (representing approximately 72\% of total expenses) increased $22 \%$ from 2008 to 2014. In comparison, overall taxicab rates including fuel surcharges increased just 6\%. Excluding fuel surcharges, taxicab rates grew between $0 \%$ and $1 \%$, depending on origin.

Prior analyses revealed that operating costs were rising faster than rate increases from 2008 to 2014.

## Las Vegas Operators' Expenses v. Rates



## Prior analyses revealed that operating costs were rising faster than rate increases from 2008 to 2014.

Taxicab operators faced across-the-board increases in major expenses. As an example, driver wages, which represent more than 40 percent of all expenses, increased $20.4 \%$ from 2008 to 2014, partly due to an 11\%-increase in the minimum wage.


The analysis found that (1) a 4.7\%-increase in the rate would be needed to keep up with the minimum wage increase and (2) a $15.7 \%$-increase in the rate would be required to keep up with overall business cost increases.

Disparity in taxicab operating costs and rates showed there was potential for rate adjustments.

Potential Rate Adjustment Scenarios

## Baseline

Scenario

- An increase of approximately 4.7-percent in each component (outside of fuel surcharges) would be required solely to keep pace with the baseline minimum wage increase.


 ftom taurcharcharge.

Comprehensive Cost
Analysis-based Scenario
- An increase of 15.7 percent in each component would be required to keep pace with rising costs of doing business, including major expenses such as health insurance, vehicle insurance, and increasingly technical


## Illustration of Potential Rate Adjustments

Increases are compared to 2008 | Baseline + Cost Analysis-based Scena


This $8.0 \%$ increase was slightly less than the rate of inflation of $1.6 \%$ CAGR or $10 \%$ total during the same time period.


Since July 2013, drop fees have increased \$0.20 (6.1\%) to \$3.50. Per mile fees excluding the surcharge have increased $\$ 0.36(15.0 \%)$ to $\$ 2.76$.

| Date | Drop <br> Fee | Per Mile Fee <br> (Inc. Fuel <br> Surcharge) | Per Mile Fee <br> (Exc. Fuel <br> Surcharge) | Notes |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| $11 / 13 / 2008$ | $\$ 3.30$ | --- | $\$ 2.40$ |  |
| $4 / 26 / 2011$ | $\$ 3.30$ | $\$ 2.60(\$ 0.20$ Fuel <br> Surcharge) | $\$ 2.40$ |  |
| $7 / 1 / 2013$ | $\$ 3.30$ | $\$ 2.60(\$ 0.20$ Fuel <br> Surcharge) | $\$ 2.40$ | McCarran Airport fee <br> raised $\$ 0.20$ to $\$ 2.00$ |
| $10 / 20 / 2014$ | $\$ 3.45$ | $\$ 2.88(\$ 0.20$ Fuel <br> Surcharge) | $\$ 2.68$ | Wait time fee raised <br> $\$ 2.40$ to \$32.40/hr. |
| $12 / 17 / 2014$ | $\$ 3.45$ | --- | $\$ 2.68$ |  |
| $8 / 24 / 2015$ | $\$ 3.50$ | $\$ 2.88(\$ 0.12$ Fuel <br> Surcharge) | $\$ 2.76$ | $3 \%$ excise tax added <br> to all fares \& fees |
| $11 / 16 / 2015$ | $\$ 3.50$ | --- | $\$ 2.76$ |  |
| Sour |  |  |  |  |

Source: Nevada Taxicab Authority. Note: Data are reported for November 13, 2008 going forward.

Increases in the drop and per mile fees have generally fallen between the mid-range and cost analysis-based scenarios.

Las Vegas Taxicab Rate Comparison
2014 (Potential Scenarios)

| Component | Baseline Scenario $(+4.7 \%)$ | Mid-Range Scenario (Approx. +8.0\%) | Cost Analysis-based <br> Scenario (+15.7\%) |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Drop for $1^{\text {st }} 1 / 12^{\text {th }}$ mile | \$3.46 | $\$ 3.45$ <br> (Note: Represents only a $+4 \cdot 5 \%$ increase) | \$3.82 |
| Each additional $1 / 12^{\text {th }}$ mile | $\$ 0.21$ (\$2.52/ mile + $\$ 0.20 /$ mile fuel surcharge, or \$2.72/ mile | $\$ 0.22$ ( $\$ 2.64 /$ mile $+\$ 0.20 /$ mile fuel surcharge, or $\$ 2.84 /$ mile) <br> (Note: Represents no change to fuel surcharge amount of $\$ 0.20 / \mathrm{mile}$ ) | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 0.23(\$ 2.76 / \text { mile }+ \\ & \$ 0.20 / \text { mile fuel } \\ & \text { surcharge, or } \$ 2.96 / \mathrm{mile} \end{aligned}$ |
| Waiting time/hour | \$31.41 | \$32.40 | \$34.71 |
| McCarran Airport fee | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 2.00 \\ & \text { (N/A - No change) } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 2.00 \\ & \text { (N/A - No change) } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \$ 2.00 \\ & \text { (N/A - No change) } \end{aligned}$ |

Source: Scenarios calculated by AA based on confidential survey data of Las Vegas operators; rate per mile calculated based on rounded rate per $1 / 12$ mile,
Luvery opezarors assocation LAS VEGAS TAXICAB RATE ANALYSIS

## Taxicab Rates have Not Kept Pace with Operating Cost Increases

- Prior analyses show that taxicab rate increases have not kept pace with growth in operating costs.
- The baseline scenario concluded that an increase of approximately $4.7 \%$ would have been required to keep pace with the minimum wage increase alone. The comprehensive cost analysis-based scenario concluded that an increase of approximately $15.7 \%$ would have been required to keep pace with rising business costs.
- A mid-range increase of $8.0 \%$ would have been just under the rate of inflation. Over time, rate adjustments have generally fallen between the mid-range and cost analysis-based scenarios.



## THE FUEL SURCHARGE

## QUESTION

## Have the fuel surcharges appropriately addressed spikes in fuel prices?

## Average Price of Gasoline Per Gallon (Regular Grade)

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { The board used federal } \\
& \text { data for fuel prices to } \\
& \text { support the surcharge. } \\
& \text { Actual fuel prices in } \\
& \text { Las Vegas/Clark } \\
& \text { County are lower. }
\end{aligned}
$$

Federal data shows there were 17 weeks where fuel prices were above the stateapproved threshold of $\$ 3.25$ per gallon. Actual surcharges imposed by the board lasted just under 12 weeks.

Average Price of Gasoline Per Gallon (Regular Grade): West Coast


Source: Gas prices are from the Energy Information Administration; fuel surcharge calculations by Applied Analysis.

## Local fuel prices were generally lower than the state-approved threshold of $\$ 3.25$ per gallon.

Average Price of Gasoline Per Gallon (Regular Grade): www.gasbuddy.com



Source: Gas prices are from the Oil Price Information Service and includes data from Gasbudy.com; fuel surcharge calculations by Applied Analysis.

## Fuel Charges were Applied Properly but Could be Modified

- Federal data for fuel prices are used to determine when a fuel surcharge is applied. These prices are higher than local fuel prices.
- If both the fuel price index and the trigger point were both modified consistent with Las Vegas prices and the 10-year average, the fuel surcharge would have still been imposed in 2015.
- Fuel surcharges were applied properly and for a time period shorter than authorized.
- Modifications should consider both the index and trigger point.



## ADDITIONAL CHARGES

## QUESTION

## Are credit card convenience fees appropriately applied?

> Credit card fees, at \$3.00, may exceed costs, but Nevada Revised Statutes does not limit these fees solely to costs.

NRS 706.88355 Acceptance of credit cards or debit cards for payment of rates, fares and charges: Contracts with issuers; regulations; certain acts by issuers prohibited.

1. A certificate holder may enter into a contract with an issuer of credit cards and debit cards to provide for the acceptance of credit cards or debit cards by the certificate holder for the payment of rates, fares and charges owed to the certificate holder.
2. The Taxicab Authority may prescribe by regulation or order the maximum fee that a certificate holder may charge a customer for the convenience of using a credit card or debit card to make payment to the certificate holder. In prescribing such fees, the Taxicab Authority may consider the expenses incurred by the certificate holder in accepting payment by a credit "card or debit card, including, without limitation:
(a) Costs of required equpthent and its hinstalation;
(b) Administrative costs of processing credit card or debit card transactions; and

- (c) Fees paid to issuers of credit cards or debit cards
-     - " 3 . "An issuer shalinnot, by contract or otherwise:
(a) Prohibit a certificate holder from charging and collecting a fee authorized pursuant to subsection 2 ; or
(b) Require a certificate holder to waive the right to charge and collect a fee authorized pursuant to subsection 2 .

4. As used in this section, "issuer" means a business organization, financial institution or a duly authorized agency of a business organization or financial institution which:
(a) Issues a credit card or debit card; or
(b) Enters into a contract with a certificate holder or other person to enable or facilitate the acceptance of a credit card or debit card.
(Added to NRS by 2011, 3658)

For those jurisdictions that do regulate, there is no single approach:

| Jurisdiction | Max Credit Card Convenience Fee |
| :--- | :--- |
| Chicago, IL | $4 \%$ |
| Philadelphia, PA | $5 \%$ |
| Miami, FL | $\$ 2.70$ discount if cash payment |
| Las Vegas, NV | $\$ 3.00$ |

Source: New York City Taxi and Limousine Commission; City of Los Angeles Department of Transportation; City of Houston Administration \& Regulatory Affairs Department; Seattle Regulatory Compliance \& Consumer Protection; D.C. Municipal Regulations 13-801 Passenger Rates and Charges; Chicago Business Affairs Consumer Protection; The Pennsylvania Code and Miami-Dade County Department of Transportation and Public Works.

## Approaches Differ by Jurisdiction, but Nevada's Costs have Remained Unchanged Since Inception

- Nevada Revised Statutes does not limit the credit card fee to those items considered in the State Audit Report.
- Most communities build credit card fees into the rate structure, meaning that riders who do not use credit cards bear some convenience cost burden.
- As currently structured a customer can opt out of paying the credit card fee by paying cash.
- The credit card fee is a known cost to consumers, printed on the door of every taxi in operation.
- The fee has been in existence at the same rate since 2004.



## COMPETITIVE LANDSCAPE

## QUESTION

## What is the competitive landscape and why does it matter?

## Taxicab Trips \& Revenues are Down



Source: Nevada Taxicab Authority.

A 3\% excise tax on fares \& fees mandated by the 2015 legislature, as well as increased competition from transportation network companies (TNCs) like Lyft and Uber are contributing to trip and revenue declines.


Lifts on operating volume and geographic restrictions have been added to ease the competitive landscape, but are they working?


## The negative effects of

 state reports, which cast the industry in an inaccurate and disparaging light, have also contributed to the industry's decline.
## USNEWS NEWS



```
News Opinion National lssues Best Countries Cartoons Photos
```

Ken Walsh's Washington Decision 2016 The Run 2016 The Chase Wasi

Discounts on Windows
shop at The Home Depot And Get 15\% Off Select Special Or Click for More Info

65 Comments
Audit: Las Vegas-area cabs overc public by $\$ 47 \mathrm{M}$ a year

루믿

Las Vegas Cabs Are Massively Overcharging Riders

State auditors say Las Vegas-area cabs are overchargi to the tune of $\$ 47$ million a year.

4 SOUTHERN CALIFORNIA



Los angeles • orange • riverside • san bernabolino •ventura


Watch Live: NBC4 News
SAN MANUEL INDIAN: "BINGO \& CASINO

Vegas cab riders come out \$47M-a-year losers, audit finds

Las Vegas Taxis Rip Off Airport Passeng
Taxicab companies are disputing the report, saying it used narrow evidence By Brandon Lowrey

Home metros

## (f) Uhe 風ilawe所ia Uribune

THE FUTURE OF BLACK AMERICA
REGISTER HERE
Thursda
Pennsylv
UR Problems Peol SAutions
me , Metros


Ultimately, the goal is to increase transportation, not decrease transportation, for tourists and residents in the Las Vegas area.


## TAXI



TAXICAB RATES \& CHARGES
IN SOUTHERN NEVADA

A Review \& Analysis

